

## Phil 108, Second Paper Topic

**Due:** Tuesday, March 11, by 9:40am.

**Maximum Length:** Three double-spaced pages, 12-point font, one-inch margins

Answer **one** of the following. (Note: the only difference between them is the text in **bold**.)

1. Diverting the trolley in Trolley Driver, which brings it about that five people live (who would otherwise die) but that one dies (who would otherwise live), seems permissible. However, transplanting the organs in Transplant, which *also* brings it about that five people live (who would otherwise die) but that one dies (who would otherwise live), seems *impermissible*. (See Thomson, “The Trolley Problem,” for a fuller description of these cases.) How might one use the Doctrine of **Double Effect** to explain the difference in permissibility? Is this explanation adequate? Why or why not?

2. Diverting the trolley in Trolley Driver, which brings it about that five people live (who would otherwise die) but that one dies (who would otherwise live), seems permissible. However, transplanting the organs in Transplant, which *also* brings it about that five people live (who would otherwise die) but that one dies (who would otherwise live), seems *impermissible*. (See Thomson, “The Trolley Problem,” for a fuller description of these cases.) How might one use the Doctrine of **Doing and Allowing** to explain the difference in permissibility? Is this explanation adequate? Why or why not?