Phil 108, Second Paper Topic

Due: Tuesday, March 11, by 9:40am.
Maximum Length: Three double-spaced pages, 12-point font, one-inch margins

Answer one of the following. (Note: the only difference between them is the text in bold.)

1. Diverting the trolley in Trolley Driver, which brings it about that five people live (who would otherwise die) but that one dies (who would otherwise live), seems permissible. However, transplanting the organs in Transplant, which also brings it about that five people live (who would otherwise die) but that one dies (who would otherwise live), seems impermissible. (See Thomson, “The Trolley Problem,” for a fuller description of these cases.) How might one use the Doctrine of Double Effect to explain the difference in permissibility? Is this explanation adequate? Why or why not?

2. Diverting the trolley in Trolley Driver, which brings it about that five people live (who would otherwise die) but that one dies (who would otherwise live), seems permissible. However, transplanting the organs in Transplant, which also brings it about that five people live (who would otherwise die) but that one dies (who would otherwise live), seems impermissible. (See Thomson, “The Trolley Problem,” for a fuller description of these cases.) How might one use the Doctrine of Doing and Allowing to explain the difference in permissibility? Is this explanation adequate? Why or why not?